## WESTERN DISTRICT OF LOUISIANA

## ALEXANDRIA DIVISION

DEVY FOSTER, et al. CIVIL ACTION NO. 17-CV-00656

VERSUS CHIEF JUDGE DRELL

WAL-MART LOUISIANA, L.L.C. MAGISTRATE JUDGE PEREZ-MONTES

## SUA SPONTE JURISDICTIONAL REVIEW FINDINGS

Before the Court is a Complaint filed by Plaintiffs Devy Foster and Charles Foster. The action was removed by Defendant Wal-Mart Louisiana, L.L.C. from a Louisiana state court. Wal-Mart Louisiana, L.L.C. premises federal jurisdiction on diversity of citizenship.

The diversity statute – 28 U.S.C. § 1332 – is satisfied upon a showing of: (1) diversity of citizenship between the parties; and (2) an amount in controversy in excess of \$75,000, exclusive of interest and costs. "Complete diversity requires that all persons on one side of the controversy be citizens of different states than all persons on the other side." Harvey v. Grey Wolf Drilling Co., 542 F.3d 1077, 1079 (5th Cir. 2008) (internal citation and quotation omitted). Further, "when jurisdiction depends on citizenship, citizenship must be distinctly and affirmatively alleged." Getty Oil Corp., a Div. of Texaco, Inc. v. Ins. Co. of N. Am., 841 F.2d 1254, 1259 (5th Cir. 1988).

The Court has "an independent obligation to determine whether subjectmatter jurisdiction exists, even in the absence of a challenge from any party." Arbaugh v. Y&H Corp., 546 U.S. 500, 514 (2006). This duty persists throughout all phases of the litigation, "even after trial and the entry of final judgment." <u>Id.</u> at 506-07.

The citizenship of an individual is his or her domicile, meaning the place where an individual resides and intends to remain. Acridge v. Evangelical Lutheran Good Samaritan Soc., 334 F.3d 444, 448 (5th Cir. 2003). A corporation shall be deemed to be a citizen of every State and foreign state by which it has been incorporated and of the State or foreign state where it has its principal place of business. Tewari De-Ox Systems, Inc. v. Mountain States/Rosen, L.L.C., 757 F.3d 481, 483 (5th Cir. 2014). The citizenship of a general partnership depends on that of all partners. International Paper Co. v. Denkmann Associates, 116 F.3d 134, 135, 137 (5th Cir. 1997). The citizenship of an LLC, a limited partnership, or other unincorporated association or entity is determined by the citizenship of all its members. Harvey, 542 F.3d at 1079-80.

Plaintiffs Devy Foster and Charles Foster are citizens of Louisiana.

Defendant Wal-Mart Louisiana, L.L.C. is a limited liability company owned by Wal-Mart Stores East, L.P., a limited partnership composed of two partners, WSE Management, L.L.C. (GP) and WSE Investment, L.L.C. (LP), both Delaware limited liability companies. The sole owner of each is Wal-Mart Stores East, Inc., an Arkansas corporation with its principal place of business in Arkansas. Therefore, Wal-Mart Louisiana, L.L.C. is a citizen of Arkansas.

Accordingly, diversity jurisdiction is established. No further action is necessary at this time.

THUS DONE AND SIGNED in chambers in Alexandria, Louisiana, this <u>26th</u> day of May, 2017.

Joseph H.L. Perez Montes

United States Magistrate Judge

Art Unit: 1653

(Determination of the apparent dissociation constants for bound retinoids)). In this particular way, Wang et al. ultimately produced compositions of  $\beta$ -lactoglobulin with retinoids, which is inclusive of the specific molecule retinol. These compositions subsequently meet the limitations as set forth in the instant claims and are rejected as having been anticipated by Wang et al.

(e) the invention was described in (1) an application for patent, published under section 122(b), by another filed in the United States before the invention by the applicant for patent or (2) a patent granted on an application for patent by another filed in the United States before the invention by the applicant for patent, except that an international application filed under the treaty defined in section 351(a) shall have the effects for purposes of this subsection of an application filed in the United States only if the international application designated the United States and was published under Article 21(2) of such treaty in the English language.

4. Claims 1-16 are rejected under 35 U.S.C. 102(e) as being anticipated by Ferruzzi. Ferruzzi teaches a natural energy drink which comprises several ingredients which include: 1% whey protein, 0.01% ascorbic acid and 0.26% vitamin fortification premix (see p.7, example 1, paragraph [0078]). The vitamin fortification premix consists of several ingredients including vitamin A, vitamin C and vitamin E acetate (see p. 7, paragraph [0079]).

In considering how this composition relates to the instant claims, several definitions need to be clarified. By definition and according to PDR Health (see p.1,  $2^{nd}$  paragraph under Description) whey protein can be considered a generic term as it includes 70-80%  $\alpha$ -lactoglobulin and  $\beta$ -lactoglobulin. The next three definitions have all been defined by Webster's 1913 Dictionary as found on-line. The definition of vitamin A is set-forth as: "Vitamin A is any of several related fat-soluble vitamins (such as retinol) essential for normal vision" (see p. 1 of on-line definition). The definition of vitamin C is set-forth as: "A vitamin that prevents

Art Unit: 1653

scurvy. Also called ascorbic acid" (see p. 1 of on-line definition). The definition of vitamin E is set-forth as: "A fat-soluble vitamin that is essential for normal reproduction; an important anti-oxidant that neutralizes free radicals in the body". A synonym of vitamin E is defined as tocopherol (see p. 1 of on-line definition).

When considering the above definitions it is possible to directly relate them to the instant claims of this rejection. Claim 5 claims a composition of 0.01-1% of an oxygen labile active ingredient and 0.1-10% lactoglobulin. Claim 6 further limits claim 5 by defining the oxygen labile active ingredient as being any of the following: ascorbic acid, tocotrienol, hydroquinone, ubiquinone and dihydrolipoic acid. Therefore Ferruzzi's composition for the energy drink falls within the limitations of the claims, e.g., the drink contains 1% whey protein which contains lactoglobulins as defined above and 0.01% ascorbic acid. Claim 7 further limits claim 5 in claiming that the oxygen labile active agent is a retinoid. Wang et al., as stated above, teaches that retinoid is a generic term which includes the following specific molecules: retinal, retinoic acid, retinol and retinyl acetate (see Table 1., p. 1051). Furthermore, as defined by Webster's dictionary as stated above, retinol is also known as Vitamin A. Once again, Ferruzzi's energy drink composition meets the limitations of these claims since the composition also includes Vitamin A at 0.26%.

5. The same rationale is used for the claim rejections for claims 9-16.

However, claim 9 has two additional ingredients in the composition, on top of lactoglobulin and an oxygen labile active ingredient, as compared to claim 5.

These ingredients are claimed as an isoascorbic acid derivative and a tocopherol

Art Unit: 1653

derivative. Claim 10 further limits claim 9 by stating that the oxygen labile active ingredient is 0.001-20%, the isoascorbic acid derivative is .001-0.5%, the tocopherol derivative is 0.1-1% and the lactoglobulin is 0.1-10%. Therefore Ferruzzi's composition for the energy drink falls within the limitations of the claims, e.g., the drink contains 1% whey protein which contains lactoglobulins as defined above, 0.01% ascorbic acid which by definition can be deemed as being an isoascorbic acid derivative (N.B. A derivative is defined as a chemical substance related structurally to another substance and theoretically derivable from it). In the same rationale, a tocopherol derivative would be vitamin E acetate. As defined above, tocopherol is a synonym for vitamin E and vitamin E acetate can be derived from vitamin E. Claim 12 and 15 further limits claims 9 and 10, respectively, in claiming that the oxygen labile active agent is a retinoid. Wang et al., as stated above, teaches that retinoid is a generic term which includes the following specific molecules: retinal, retinoic acid, retinol and retinyl acetate (see Table 1., p. 1051). Furthermore, as defined by Webster's dictionary as stated above, retinol is also known as Vitamin A. Once again, Ferruzzi's energy drink composition meets the limitations of these claims since the composition also includes Vitamin A at 0.26% in addition to 1% whey protein (lactoglobulin), ascorbic acid 0.01% and a tocopherol derivative (vitamin E acetate) which is also at 0.26%.

Therefore the energy drink composition as taught by Ferruzzi is a composition which meets the limitations of the instant claims and thus are rejected.

Application/Control Number: 10/645,811

Art Unit: 1653

## Conclusion

6. No claim is allowed.

7. Any inquiry concerning this communication or earlier communications from the examiner should be directed to Suzanne M. Mayer, Ph.D. whose telephone number is 571-272-2924. The examiner can normally be reached Monday to Friday from 8.30am to 5.00pm.

If attempts to reach the examiner by telephone are unsuccessful, the examiner's supervisor, Jon Weber can be reached on 571-272-0925. The fax phone number for the organization where this application or proceeding is assigned is 703-872-9306.

Information regarding the status of an application may be obtained from the Patent Application Information Retrieval (PAIR) system. Status information for published applications may be obtained from either Private PAIR or Public PAIR. Status information for unpublished applications is available through Private PAIR only. For more information about the PAIR system, see http://pair-direct.uspto.gov. Should you have questions on access to the Private PAIR system, contact the Electronic Business Center (EBC) at 866-217-9197 (toll-free).

SMM

24 August, 2004

Jesty J

lon P. Weber, Ph.D. Primary Examiner